

## **Health Report**

## **Novel Coronavirus – Review of Temporary Border Measures**

Date due to MO:	14 February 2020	Action required by:	14 February 2020
Security level:	IN CONFIDENCE	Health Report number:	20200201
To:	Ministers with Power to	o Act - Novel Coronavirus	0
Copy to:	Hon lain Lees-Gallowa	y, Minister of Immigration	S
	Hon Jenny Salesa, Min	ister of Customs	$\sim$
		<u> </u>	
Ministers with Power to Act	novel coronavirus outb	vith Power to Act on New Zeal preak comprising the Prime M ffairs, Tourism, Finance, Educa	inister, and the
Contact for te	elephone discussio	n	
Name	Position		Telephone s .9(2)(a)
Dr Ashley Bloom	nfield Director-Gen	eral, Ministry of Health	
Deborah Geels		etary, Ministry of Foreign tilateral and Legal Affairs	
Ruth Isaac		ager, Ministry of Business nd Employment -Labour and Policy	

## **Action for Private Secretaries**

Return the signed report to the Ministries of Health, Business, Innovation and Employment, and Foreign Affairs and Trade. Date dispatched to MO:



# Novel Coronavirus – Review of Temporary Border Measures

## **Purpose of report**

This report sets out the options for changes to the current temporary border measures in place in response to the novel coronavirus (COVID-19) outbreak. It seeks approval by Ministers with Power to Act to retain New Zealand's border measure response for another 9 days and reviewed every 48 hours.

## **Key points**

- On 2 February 2020, additional border measures were enacted in response to the COVID-19 outbreak [CAB-20-Min-0015 refers] consistent with agreed national pandemic response procedures.
- The current measures will expire at 23:59 on Sunday 16 February 2020. A rapid decision on New Zealand's border measures is needed from Ministers with Power to Act by Friday 14 February 2020 to allow officials to give effect to the decision.
- The New Zealand border is currently closed to foreign nationals who have been in, or transited through, mainland China after 23:59 on 2 February 2020 (with limited exceptions for Australians that reside in New Zealand and air crews).
- The overall situation regarding COVID-19 is rapidly evolving with a high degree of uncertainty, and we continue to take a precautionary approach that is underlying the current border travel restrictions. New Zealand is in the 'Keep it Out' phase of the agreed national pandemic response procedures (as set out in the New Zealand Influenza Pandemic Plan NZIPP).
- In addition to border response measures, we have implemented additional measures under the pandemic response procedures including:
  - activating the National Health Coordination Centre (NHCC) to provide national coordination and direction
  - arranging and implementing organised isolation for New Zealanders returning from Wuhan
    - expecting New Zealanders returning from mainland China to self isolate for 14 days
  - providing advice to the New Zealand public on self-isolation and measures to reduce spread of disease
  - providing support for those in self-isolation, providing guidance to health professionals on preparing and managing suspected and confirmed cases, monitoring and appropriately responding to the evolving international situation
  - working closely with other relevant agencies, and preparing for the potential next stages of the epidemic.



- New Zealand should continue to consider adopting border measures consistent with comparable countries, in particular Australia. The Australian Government has extended the expiry of their current border arrangements to Saturday 22 February 2020.
- Officials have reviewed the border measures considering the threat to public health in New Zealand and Pacific Islands in the context of potential impacts on foreign relations and the risk of significant adverse economic impacts along with the readiness of agencies to operationalise any measures.
- Officials' advice is that the COVID-19 outbreak continues to present a substantial threat to public health and that this threat outweighs any economic or foreign relations impacts that result from the current border measures.
- Officials recommend retaining current temporary border measures for an additional 9-day period (to align with Cabinet decision making) limited to cover people who have been in or transited mainland China in the 14 days prior to boarding. These measures will be reviewed every 48 hours based on the updated factors set out at Appendix Three and officials will provide immediate advice should any information emerge that has a significant impact on these measures.
- Over coming weeks, we expect our understanding of the virus epidemiology and wider global situation to deepen. This understanding will guide future decisions about broader measures including their extent and the length of time measures might remain in place.
- At this time, any decision to relax current border measures while protecting public health will require significant resources to implement operational changes (public health screening, supported isolation facilities, immigration and customs structural changes etc) and time to do so. Continuing the current temporary border measures is the most practicable short-term option to effectively mitigate the threat to public health.
- Officials will provide you with further cross-government advice next week based on the developing global situation and understanding, including potential further actions if needed.

## Consultation

The Ministry of Health, the Ministry of Business, Innovation and Employment, and the Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Trade have consulted with:

- Relevant Government Chief Science Advisors
- The Treasury
- Ministry for Primary Industries
- Ministry of Education
- New Zealand Customs
- New Zealand Police.

The Ministry of Health as lead agency is working on a daily basis with other government departments and agencies involved in the national response to COVID-19.



## Recommendations

It is recommended that you:

a)	<b>Note</b> that temporary additional border measures that were enacted in response to the COVID-19 outbreak will expire at 23:59 on Sunday 16 February 2020.	Yes/No
b)	<b>Note</b> advice that there is a continued high threat to public health and that this threat outweighs any increased economic or foreign relation impacts that result from the temporary additional border measures.	Yes/No
c)	<b>Note</b> advice that we expect our understanding of the virus epidemiology and wider global situation to deepen, which will guide future advice about border measures including their extent and the length of time measures might remain in place.	Yes/No
d)	<b>Agree</b> to retain the current temporary border measures for an additional 9- day period expiring at 23:59 on Tuesday 25 February 2020 but limited to cover people who have been in or transited mainland China in the 14 days prior to boarding.	Yes/No
e)	<b>Agree</b> that the temporary border measures will be reviewed every 48 hours based on the updated factors set out at Appendix Three, and that officials will provide immediate advice should any information emerge that has a substantial impact on the border measures.	Yes/No
f)	<b>Invite</b> the Minister of Immigration to give effect to your decision in recommendation (d) through issuing Immigration Instructions.	Yes/No
g)	<b>Note</b> key messages have been developed to support public communication of your decision in recommendation (d).	Yes/No
h)	<b>Note</b> the Minister of Health will issue a media release announcing this decision.	
i)	<b>Note</b> the Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Trade will inform China and key Pacific partners of your decision in recommendation (d) ahead of public communication.	Yes/No
j)	<b>Note</b> the Ministry of Health will inform Australia and the World Health Organisation of your decision in recommendation (d) ahead of public communication.	Yes/No



 k) Note officials are preparing advice for Ministers with Power to Act on potential further actions based on the developing global situation and understanding.

Yes/No





## Background

#### Overview

1. On 2 February 2020, Ministers with Power to Act agreed to implement border measures to strengthen New Zealand's response to the COVID-19 outbreak [CAB-20-Min-0015 refers].

#### **Current Temporary Border Measures**

- 2. On 2 February 2020 New Zealand implemented additional border measures:
  - a. To extend the travel history in the case definition for COVID-19 infection to include travel to mainland China (previously this was Hubei province in China, particularly Wuhan)
  - b. to deny entry into New Zealand to people who have left or transited through mainland China from 02 February 2020, with the exception of:
    - i. New Zealand citizens (including those from the three Countries of the Realm: Tokelau, Niue and the Cook Islands), and residents and their immediate family and Australian citizens and permanent residents normally resident in New Zealand
    - ii. People covered by regulation 25 of the Immigration (Visa, entry permission, and related matters) Regulations 2010. This includes guests of government.
    - iii. Air crews who have been using appropriate personal protective equipment (PPE).
- 3. On 4 February 2020 Ministers with Power to Act agreed that there would not be a region-wide exemption for Pacific citizens at this stage, but that any requests would be considered on a case-by-case basis. Diplomats are also being facilitated on a case by case basis.

#### Updates on situation

- 4. The Ministry of Health has been providing assessments of border advice for New Zealand every 48 hours which was reassessed on 12 February 2020. There is no change at this point to the advice already in place. New Zealand's response and planning is well advanced and will continue to evolve with the global situation.
- New Zealand's risk assessment is that the likelihood of one or more imported cases of COVID-19 infection in New Zealand is **HIGH**. The likelihood of limited transmission is **HIGH** and the likelihood of sustained transmission, and widespread outbreaks is **LOW-MODERATE**.
- Given the assessment of the likelihood of importation, transmission in New Zealand and the public health impact, the overall public health risk from this event is considered **HIGH**. This remains unchanged since the implementation of temporary border measures on 2 February 2020.



#### Approach to assessment of situation

- 7. New Zealand has undertaken a considered and deliberate response to the global public health issue relating to the COVID-19 outbreak. Given the potential severity of the threat to public health, New Zealand's strategy is to take every practicable step in the designated 'Keep It Out' and 'Stamp it Out' phases before moving to a 'Manage It' phase.
- 8. This strategy allows more time to gain a deeper understanding of the virus and the best way to manage the disease, prepare to mobilise further responses in the health sector and other sectors, and reinforce public understanding of appropriate hygiene measures. It is critical to focus efforts on trying to keep the virus out in the early stages of the pandemic, or at least delay the arrival of the virus, to allow time for the health sector to be fully ready to deal with the impact of this novel disease and possible virus attenuation. Effective border management is currently the best way to protect New Zealanders from the health effects of a potential outbreak.
- 9. The decision to act has required strong border controls to be implemented initially. It is recommended that border controls be maintained, until the global situation becomes clearer. The reasoning for this is that measures can always be relaxed, but if sufficient measures are not put in place and maintained in the early stages, the option to escalate measures (border measures and other broader measures) may no longer be available later.
- 10. We have weighed up the potential health impacts in the context of the economic, foreign relations and other broader impacts of this approach. We consider the risk of adverse public health impacts, outweighs the other potential impacts at this stage. The direct economic impacts of New Zealand's temporary border measures are expected to be relatively low in the short term. External factors, in particular from China, are the primary drivers of the economic impacts being felt. Economic impacts would be more significant and potentially long-lasting if there was a significant outbreak of disease in New Zealand.
- 11. Protecting the health of the New Zealand population should be prioritised over other considerations while the overall public health risk remains high.

#### Other nation responses

- 12. The World Health Organization (WHO) risk assessment remains: **very high in China; high at the regional level; and high at the global level.** The WHO continues to not recommend any specific measures for travellers and advises against the application of any travel or trade restrictions on China based on the current information.
- 13. New Zealand is one of 46 other countries and or territories with border measures broadly equivalent to New Zealand.<sup>1</sup> Those countries that have lifted or not imposed measures appear to be opting for the alternative of compulsory quarantine on arrival. The situation is subject to change, and some countries are currently in the process of implementing additional restrictions.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> In total 72 countries and territories have a variety of border measures. Additional details set out at Appendix 4



- 14. It would be prudent for New Zealand to continue to consider border measures against comparable countries, in particular Australia, while ensuring actions are based on the New Zealand situation.
- 15. The Australian Government has extended the expiry of their current border arrangements to Saturday 22 February 2020.

### Options

- 16. We recommend Ministers take into account the following factors in making current decisions on border restrictions relating to the COVID-19 outbreak:
  - a. the risk to the health of New Zealanders,
  - b. the risk to the health of Pacific island countries
  - c. the readiness of agencies to operationalise any measures.
- 17. These factors should be considered in the context of the following considerations that will become more important over time:
  - a. risk to foreign relations,
  - b. the risk of significant adverse economic impacts.
- 18. The following table sets out the broad range of border responses available and factors for consideration (refer paragraph 16). Contextual factors set out in paragraph 17 above, only inform timeline and longer-term risks in the table.

rogi

## Options

	1. No Restrictions	2. Restrictions with	3. Restrictions (current state)
	NOT RECOMMENDED	exemptions NOT CURRENTLY VIABLE	RECOMMENDED
	Lift the ban all together, reverting to business as usual.	General ban with large scale exemptions for classes of visa, eg all Chinese students. Not viable without large scale organised self-isolation options available. Large scale operational impacts.	Retain current border restrictions. The current state includes scope for very small scale case-by-case exceptions.
Factors for consideration This describes indicative factors that would lead to change to temporary border measures. <sup>2</sup>		C	
1. Public Health – New Zealand	<ul> <li>Threat to New Zealand citizens is within a manageable level if there are no border restrictions.</li> <li>Public health measures are sufficient to contain outbreak if there are no border restrictions (e.g. entry screening, capability of self-isolation (quarantine))</li> <li>The NZ health system is capable of responding to a potential outbreak (e.g. managing potential cases)</li> <li>Capacity and availability of resources to manage travellers (e.g. entry screening, capability of self-isolation (quarantine))</li> <li>Disease epidemiology (including transmissibility and severity of illness) suggests threat to population is reduced to acceptable levels</li> <li>Number of current cases in New Zealand is such that border restrictions are proven to be of limited or no value and resources</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Threat to New Zealand citizens is within a controllable level for New Zealand citizens cohorts subject to proposed exemption.</li> <li>Capacity and availability of resources to enforce exemptions (e.g. entry screening, capability of self-isolation (quarantine))</li> <li>The NZ health system capable of responding to border restrictions with exemptions (e.g. managing potential cases)</li> <li>Disease epidemiology (including transmissibility and severity of illness) suggests the health threat to the New Zealand population is acceptable for specific proposed exemptions</li> <li>Current response aims (e.g. stage of NZIPP) suggests reduced restrictions.</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Current health system preparedness not yet complete</li> <li>No change in disease epidemiology</li> <li>No change to New Zealand's current risk assessment</li> <li>No change to response aims (e.g. stage of NZIPP)</li> </ul>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Assessment of these factors will depend on availability of information. Public health factors for consideration that will be regularly reviewed are set out at Appendix 3.



4.	Increased Restrictions
	NOT RECOMMENDED
	border restrictions to travellers Iditional countries.
•	No change in current health system preparedness
•	Disease epidemiology (including transmissibility and severity of illness) suggests threat to population is increased
•	WHO advice recommends increased restrictions
•	Threat to New Zealand is increased from regions or countries with sustained transmission (other than mainland China) including Australia and the Pacific (see below)
•	Current response aims (e.g. stage of NZIPP) suggests increased restrictions



	N	IANATŪ HAUORA		
	<ul> <li>could be better deployed elsewhere.</li> <li>Current response aims (e.g. stage of NZIPP) suggests no restrictions.</li> </ul>			
2. Public Health – Pacific Nations	<ul> <li>Pacific Nations' capability to respond to cases and/or outbreak has improved</li> <li>Disease epidemiology (including transmissibility and severity of illness) suggests threat to Pacific Nations population is significantly reduced</li> <li>Number of current cases in Pacific Islands is such that border restrictions are proven to be ineffective and resources could be better deployed elsewhere.</li> <li>Disease control measures and exit screening measures in source countries and high travel volume countries (e.g. New Zealand and Australia) are demonstrably effective.</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Pacific Nations' capability to respond to cases and/or outbreak in high risk settings has improved</li> <li>Disease epidemiology (including transmissibility and severity of illness) suggests threat to Pacific Nations populations are acceptable given the proposed exemptions</li> <li>Capacity and availability of New Zealand's resources to undertake actions on Pacific Nations behalf (e.g. entry screening, capability to organise self-isolation )</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>No change in threat to Pacific Nations and their ability to respond to cases and/or outbreak</li> <li>No change in disease epidemiology</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Increased threat to Pacific Nations and their ability to respond to cases and/or outbreak</li> <li>Disease epidemiology (including transmissibility and severity of illness) suggests threat to Pacific Nations is increased</li> <li>WHO advice recommends increased restrictions</li> <li>Threat to Pacific Nations is increased from regions or countries with sustained transmission (other than mainland China)</li> </ul>
3. Other country responses	<ul> <li>NZ should remain in step if possible with Australia or quorum of other countries if they lift border measures</li> </ul>	• NZ may consider specific exemptions as required if requested or cohorts identified as beneficial and low risk.	<ul> <li>NZ is currently in step with other countries (46 other countries and or territories have border measures broadly equivalent to New Zealand)</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>If outbreak occurs in high travel volume countries (through flights, maritime or other mechanisms).</li> <li>NZ should remain in step if possible with Australia or quorum of other countries if they increase border measures</li> </ul>
<b>Readiness Assessment</b> This describes the assessment of the current situation against the factors for consideration above – as at 12 February 2020.	Threat remains high due to emerging and changing global situation.	<ul> <li>Virus is currently asymptomatic so cannot identify infected travellers</li> <li>The international advance passenger processing system does not currently allow this level of granularity, and manual processing is not feasible for large numbers of people.</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Overall public health risk from this event is considered HIGH due to likelihood of importation, transmission in New Zealand and the public health impact.</li> </ul>	Risk levels remain <b>HIGH</b> and pre- emptive measures are in place.
<b>Trigger</b> This describes the conditions needed for officials to take steps toward adopting a different border approach.	<ul> <li>Significant reduction of public health risk to LOW</li> <li>Removal of restrictions in Australia or other countries</li> </ul>	• Ability to identify/screen for identifiable criteria of a manageable cohort	Current state but developing.	<ul> <li>Public health risk from this event is considered VERY HIGH</li> <li>Increased WHO assessment; or</li> </ul>



		ANATU HAUORA		
	<ul> <li>WHO assessment reduced</li> <li>Evidence that restrictions are ineffective with rising case numbers in New Zealand.</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Requests for exemption or specific change to border measures from other countries through official channels.</li> </ul>		Increase in any other country restrictions.
Risk and Timeframe This outlines the high level risk and estimated timeframe to act / implement changes.	<ul> <li>Temporary border measures can be lifted quickly following decisions. However, if other countries kept restrictions in place, lifting our ban only enables direct transit from China.</li> <li>Significant threat to public health if restrictions removed while public health system remains still preparing to deal with an outbreak.</li> <li>High risk of significant impact on pacific nations with limited capability and capacity to manage an outbreak.</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Restrictions with additional exemptions likely to take the longest time to implement to allow time to operationalise new / varied requirements.</li> <li>Significant resourcing may be required if additional measures required (e.g. entry screening or isolation/quarantine measures are put in place).</li> <li>Potential for significant impact on pacific nations with limited capability and capacity to manage an outbreak.</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Current state</li> <li>Moderate risks of negative impact on long term international relationships (discussed below)</li> <li>Moderate risk of detrimental economic impact at an industry and macro level (discussed below), over time.</li> <li>Net positive in the short term, while disease is not prevalent in New Zealand.</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Where there are further areas of concern, immigration settings could restrict / bar travel and entry to New Zealand of (up to all) foreign nationals who hold temporary visas or ETAs, Australian citizens, and Australian permanent residents, but NOT New Zealand citizens or residence class visa holders.<sup>3</sup> It is also possible to extend restrictions on travel from China to Australian nationals.</li> <li>High risk of negative impact on long term international relationships</li> <li>High risk of sustained detrimental economic impact.</li> </ul>

<sup>3</sup> Except where a resident visa has been granted to a person overseas who has not yet travelled to New Zealand (in practice, very few people)



## Short term

#### Immediate economic considerations relevant to New Zealand border measures

- 19. The COVID-19 outbreak is impacting the New Zealand economy through a number of channels. Chiefly these are: restrictions on the movement of people across borders harming the tourism and educational sectors in New Zealand; the current shutdown in China reducing Chinese demand and complicating supply circumstances for New Zealand goods; and confidence impacts which are reducing global demands more generally as travel is cancelled and spending decisions delayed. Most negative economic impacts being seen are not due to the New Zealand border restrictions, but stem from wider economic conditions not only stemming from reduced demand from China. Broader labour market supply impacts appear negligible from the border restriction measures at this stage.
- 20. Should a COVID-19 breakout in New Zealand occur we expect the economic disruption would be significant and potentially long-lasting. Taking a precautionary approach through the border closure remains the most effective way to protect New Zealand and mitigate the overall economic impacts at this stage. Over coming weeks, we expect our understanding of the virus epidemiology and wider global situation to deepen. As soon as the border restrictions can be lifted or relaxed, they should be. If New Zealand is able to manage safe and effective isolation of travellers from China at scale, or our public health requirements change so that isolation is no longer required, then it is likely that current border restrictions could be relaxed or removed.
- 21. In the short term, there are particular sectors and regions which are more vulnerable to disruptions and loss of business than others. Sectors currently feeling economic impacts because of the COVID-19 outbreak overseas include tourism, international education, and the primary sector.
- 22. Government agencies are responding in order to mitigate the economic impact of the outbreak. Support options have so far focused on addressing immediate issues associated with border closures and trading complications. Should the situation escalate, or be likely to persist for a longer period of time, it may be necessary to change or scale up the policy response. Advice is being provided in parallel on current and medium term options under different future scenarios.

#### Managing the impacts of border restrictions in the short term

- 23. In the short term, until the restrictions can be lifted, there are small scale immediate measures we are taking to provide workarounds at the border to alleviate the impacts of restrictions on people flows.
- 24. If you agree to extend the current restrictions, we can amend it to a rolling 14 day window, rather than from 2 February 2020. This means Chinese visa holders who are caught by the current border restrictions would meet our revised entry requirements by travelling to a third country and waiting out the 14 day isolation period requirements before seeking onward travel to NZ. This does potentially put pressure on third countries and relies on continued open borders and viable travel routes.
- 25. Ministers also agreed earlier this week that in certain circumstances and on a case-bycase basis, MBIE, MOH and MFAT may allow non-New Zealand nationals to travel to



New Zealand in order to undertake self-isolation or managed isolation before onward travel to their home countries provided the following conditions are met:

- a. Any public health impacts in New Zealand, the Realm, and the wider Pacific Region can be managed;
- b. There are resources available to effectively isolate, including a safe and appropriate location for the 14-day period; and
- c. They hold a valid visa to travel.
- 26. Immigration New Zealand can implement these individual, case-by-case, exemptions from the ban at the border, but it is only feasible at very small numbers. It will need to involve MFAT facilitation for government-to-government requests. This is possible within the parameters of the current border restrictions at the margins and only where the threat to public health is deemed to be manageable (ie with appropriate self-isolation arrangements in place). These manual exceptions also mean diverting immigration officers from processing visas and will impact on processing times.

#### Expanding exemptions to a larger scale is not currently operationally viable

- 27. Current visa holders in China who have previously been in New Zealand, that are caught by the restrictions, total over 12,000 people across student, work and family visa classes. There are further visa holders who have not yet travelled to New Zealand who are also caught by the ban. An estimate of the total number affected by the ban is not yet available as it would also include non-Chinese nationals who happen to be in or have been in China recently.
- 28. Expanding exemptions on a large scale eg to a whole visa class (such as students) would require the ability to enforce self-isolation and have suitable organised self-isolation options available, as well as a systems change to border processing and potentially significant operational impacts.
- 29. A large-scale exemption in immigration systems would be difficult to implement and require a system change (taking two to three weeks). A manual work around to identify particular visa holders would only be feasible at very small numbers.
- 30. There are also no suitable large-scale self-isolation facilities available currently, and no powers are available to enforce isolation at this stage. Unless that changes, implementing large-scale exemptions would increase the threat to public.
- 31. A voluntary self-isolation regime would not be sufficient to satisfy the assurances needed around isolation requirements. Even if we sought agreement to managed isolation prior to entry or boarding, capacity will likely be a constraint and the suitable size facilities potentially available may be required for New Zealanders.
- 32. In the interim, education agencies will focus on ensuring that education providers are ready to work with government agencies to manage entry of a cohort of international student visa holders into self-isolation, if and when that is safe and viable from a public health perspective.



#### Broader economic considerations

- 33. The extent of the possible economic disruption to the New Zealand economy caused by the outbreak spreading overseas is highly uncertain. The scale of the impact will depend on the timeframes and spread of the outbreak, wider economic conditions, as well as the measures taken both in New Zealand directly (including, but not exclusively decisions around border restrictions) and globally to contain the spread. China purchased 28% of New Zealand's merchandise export in 2019 and 6 of New Zealand top 20 trading partners also have China as their largest trading partner.
- 34. MBIE, Treasury, and other agencies have worked on a more detailed assessment of the economic impact provided in Appendix 5. This work considers both the implications of New Zealand's border control restrictions in the medium term, including on key affected industries, and the economic risk of allowing COVID-19 to become established in New Zealand earlier or more acutely than in other countries. We are also looking at options for domestic responses to support affected sectors, including labour supply issues, and operational policy responses.

#### Foreign relations considerations



<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> In total 72 countries and territories have a variety of border measures. Additional details set out at Appendix 4



#### Pacific Islands





44.

#### Australia

45. The unique nature of the trans-Tasman border means there are significant operational benefits for us ensuring a consistent approach with Australian border restrictions.



#### Next steps

- 47. The overall situation regarding COVID-19 internationally remains rapidly evolving with a high degree of uncertainty and we continue to recommend a precautionary approach.
- 48. We will continue to develop our understanding of the virus epidemiology and wider global situation which will:
  - Further support the readiness of the health system.



- Guide future advice about border measures.
- 49. Following your decisions, officials will:

, oaci

- Continue to review border measures against broader public health criteria every 48 hours based on the updated criteria set out at Appendix Three.
- Provide immediate advice should any information emerge that may have a substantial impact on the border measures. Provide you with further cross-government advice next week based on the developing global situation and understanding, including potential further actions if needed.
- Prepare the necessary material for the Minister of Immigration to issue Immigration Instructions to give effect to your decision.
- Implement the communication and engagement approach, including informing China, Australia, key Pacific partners and the WHO of your decision ahead of public communication.

ENDS.



## **Appendix 1: Communications Approach**

The previous border measures were announced by Prime Minister Jacinda Ardern on February 2. Officials recommend that the extension is announced by the Minister of Health.

MFAT will inform China and key Pacific partners prior to wider media release. The Ministry of Health will inform Australia and the WHO. Media may focus on the potential economic impact of the continued border measures, which has received sporadic attention over the past week. Industry groups may use an extension as an opportunity to promote stories about the impact on those they represent.

Key messages:

- The Government has agreed, based on advice given to us by relevant officials, to extend border provisions related to COVID-19 novel coronavirus.
- It is critically important that we both protect New Zealanders from the virus and play our part in the global effort to contain it.
- The current provisions were due to lapse on 16 February, but we are extending them for a further 9 days from that period.
- There has been one change to the restrictions which were put in place on 2 February 2020.
- The previous temporary border measures meant those who left or transited through mainland China from 2 February 2020 would be denied entry. This has changed to people who have left or transited through mainland China within the previous 14 days before boarding will be denied entry to New Zealand.
- This means if you left mainland China on 2 February and travelled to another country not part of the temporary border measures, then arrived in New Zealand on 18 February, you would not be denied entry.
- The temporary border measures don't apply to New Zealand citizens, including those from the three Countries of the Realm: Tokelau, Niue and the Cook Islands, permanent residents and their immediate family and air crews who have been using appropriate personal protective equipment (PPE).
- The situation with border provisions is being reviewed regularly, and this doesn't mean the provisions will stay in place for this full period, but we will do all we can to ensure we don't allow this disease into New Zealand, or facilitate the spread of it.
- New Zealand has a critical role to play as a gateway to many Pacific nations to stop the spread of novel coronavirus. An outbreak here could spread rapidly to Pacific nations, some of which would also require assistance to deal with the illness in terms of aid, medical personnel and equipment, and facilities. This isn't just about New Zealand, it's about the neighbourhood of Pacific nations.
- There is a fair amount of information still unknown about the virus, but we continue to monitor international research and the approach taken by other countries, particularly Australia.
- Information on novel coronavirus continues to be updated regularly on the Ministry of Health website, health.govt.nz



## **Appendix 2: Current border operations**

- 50. Current border related measures are:
  - a. Requiring carriers to ask all travellers before boarding if they have been in mainland China in the past 14 days, if not eligible for entry permission they will be denied boarding.
  - b. Monitoring border measures undertaken by other countries, particularly Australia, and any recommendations from WHO.
  - c. Keeping border stakeholders and the tourism industry informed through border advisories and regular meetings. This includes border agency, airport and airline staff, and accommodation providers.
  - d. Supporting border stakeholders to remind their staff of appropriate measures to protect from respiratory diseases (including from travellers from the northern hemisphere with flu as it is their flu season)
  - e. Ensuring health advice for travellers arriving in New Zealand is displayed at international ports and airports. This includes health advice cards, posters, banners and, where available, electronic signage.
  - f. Supporting public health staff at Auckland and Christchurch International Airports who are meeting and providing information to travellers on flights from mainland China and other international flights. Health staff are available at the primary line to provide advice to any travellers identified as having been in mainland China in the last 14 days. A public health nurse is available to assess and take the temperature of any passenger who reports they are unwell. If the passenger's temperature is over 38 C, this will trigger the usual ill-traveller response protocol. Passengers are being provided with information on self-isolation. As of 07 February 2020, Healthline has established a dedicated phone line for persons self-isolating to register. Healthline will be regularly checking on the welfare and wellbeing of those persons registered.
  - g. Public health staff are also available to talk to border officials and others working at the airports to answer questions about 2019-nCoV.
  - h. Responding to reports of ill travellers.
  - i. Undertaking contact tracing for casual and close contacts of confirmed cases on flights to New Zealand.

Undertaking contact tracing of close contacts in New Zealand of confirmed cases overseas.



# Appendix 3: Public Health factors for consideration for border measures review

#	High-level considerations	Factors for consideration NB: these factors have not been weighted or prioritised	Indicate if there has been a change in this factor since the last assessment	Overall comment
	Readiness of	Appropriate guidance documents and management processes available for the health system		
1	New Zealand's health system to respond to cases and/or	Scenario planning for potential impact on New Zealand's health system		
	outbreak	Current response aims (e.g. stage of NZIPAP)		
		Workforce sustainability of current and/or proposed measures		
		Epidemiology in China and worldwide e.g. containment or sustained transmission		
2	Evolving epidemiology of the outbreak	Risk to NZ from geographical areas of sustained transmission e.g. New Zealand's immediate neighbours and/or areas of high travel volume		
	•	ESR's risk assessment update		
		Relevant modelling data		
3	Emerging	Basic reproduction number (R0)*		
	evidence	Infectiousness		



	about transmissibility	Incubation period		
	Emerging	Case fatality risk		
4	evidence about severity of illness	Severe disease risk or hospitalisation rate		
5	WHO advice	Travel restrictions advice		
S		Other advice		$\mathbf{\hat{\mathbf{O}}}$
		Disease control measures in other countries/territories		
6	Public health measures in other	Exit screening measures at source countries/territories		0
	countries	Measures to prevent or delay virus entering Pacific Island countries/territories	~	0
		Effectiveness of current measures		
7	Other	Feasibility of implementing other control measures		
		Cost-benefit assessment		

\* The R0 is the average number of other people that one infected person will infect, in a completely non-immune population



## **Appendix 4: Border restrictions imposed by countries**

Source: International SOS - updated 11 February 2020

A total of 72 countries have temporary border measures, such as:

- self-quarantining on arrival, usually for 14 days
- screening on arrival and subsequent quarantining if needed
- mandatory quarantining on arrival for travellers from Hubei or all of Mainland China
- presenting a medical certificate on arrival
- cancelling visa-on-arrival services
- restricting travellers from Hubei province (except nationals)
- restricting travellers from Mainland China (except nationals)
- restricting travellers from Mainland China, Hong Kong, Macau and Taiwan (except nationals)
- restricting travellers from any location with a case of COVID-19 (except nationals)
- closing of land borders to Chinese nationals or travellers from China.

The following countries and territories have put in place temporary border measures broadly equivalent to New Zealand:

American Samoa (US), Antigua and Barbadu, Australia, Bahamas, Bangladesh, Belize, Cook Islands, El Salvador, Fiji, Gabon, Grenada, Guatemala, Hong Kong (China), India, Indonesia, Iraq, Israel, Jamaica, Jordan, Kiribati, Kosovo, Kuwait, Laos, Malaysia, Maldives, Marshall Islands, Mauritius, Micronesia, Mongolia, Myanmar, Niue, North Korea, Palau, Papua New Guinea, Paraguay, Philippines, Samoa, Seychelles, Singapore, Solomon Islands, Taiwan (China), Tonga, Trinidad and Tobago, the United States of America, Vanuatu, Vietnam.

The table below shows border measures in place for key reference countries, as at 12pm 13 February 2020.

Country	Border measures
Australia	Border and transit closed to passengers who have transited through or have been in China on or after 1 February 2020.
	Exceptions: Does not apply to airline crew. Does not apply to nationals/residents of Australia. They will be required to self-isolate for a period of 14 days from their arrival into Australia.
Canada	No measures in place
United Kingdom	No measures in places
United States of America	Border closed to passengers who have been in China in the past 14 days. Exceptions: Does not apply to nationals/residents of the USA. Passengers who have been in China in the past 14 days must arrive at one of the following airports: Atlanta, Chicago, Dallas, Detroit, Honolulu, Los Angeles, New York, San Francisco, Seattle or Washington.

## Appendix 5: Current activity and potential options

Sectors	Top Impacts	Current measures	s 9(2)(f)(iv)
Tourism	Reduced visitor numbers in peak season, China and early signs of other markets softening.Chinese visitor expenditure in February 2019 was \$264 millionAuckland, Queenstown, Rotorua are most exposed destinationsStruggling businesses are able to revise provisional tax payments, sector requires further information to clarify what support / relief is available from Inland Revenue.	<ul> <li>Visitor Sector Emergency Advisory Group sharing information, key messages and facilitating communications between the Ministry of Health (MoH), INZ, industry, RTOs, and visitors.</li> <li>MBIE is developing dashboard for near-realtime data on arrivals and visa/NZeTA application rates by country</li> <li>Working with industry to develop a suite of scenarios to inform economic impact.</li> <li>Inland Revenue's BAU tax relief is available to struggling businesses.</li> <li>TNZ re-deploying uncommitted funds to boost marketing in alternate markets (\$3m) and partnering with commercial operators.</li> </ul>	
Education	The main affected segment of education exports is the market for onshore delivery to Chinese nationals.	<ul> <li>Universities and other providers have strong accommodation and welfare safeguards in place for incountry students.</li> <li>Universities are reorienting programmes to online delivery for the first semester where possible, so that students can then continue in New Zealand</li> <li>The government has increased flexibility in visa validity, reducing the number of affected students required to apply for a further visa or pay a fee, and agreed to refund withdrawn visa applications currently in the system.</li> <li>Agencies and ministers are considering relationshipbuilding visits to China.</li> </ul>	
Primary industries	<ul> <li>The most immediate impacts being felt by New Zealand primary sector are cancelled orders, supply chain disruptions, lack of cold storage and slow clearance times. These impacts are largely due to internal travel restrictions that China has put in place to control the spread of the virus.</li> <li>More specific impacts include:</li> <li>The outbreak has significantly impacted demand for rock lobsters. China is the leading export market for live rock lobster, accounting for 99% of all exports and this is a peak time for exports. The NZ Rock Lobster Industry Council has estimated the economic impact in foregone revenue is \$63</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>The government has agreed to allow a limited release (subject to biosecurity concerns) of live rock lobster back into the wild to mitigate the impact of order cancelations.</li> <li>Regional Wood Councils are meeting and working with their members to minimise the effects of the disruption.</li> <li>Monitoring the situation in Gisborne closely and in touch with Tarawhiti Community Trust</li> <li>Exporter Regulatory Advisory Service (ERAS) advice including options for exporters to divert product to other markets and the applicable market access requirements. The ERAS helpline provides information on Coronavirus trade impacts, and enquiry contact points within MPI.</li> </ul>	
	million.	<ul> <li>Encouraging individuals and small businesses to engage early with accountants and other advisers, and</li> </ul>	





6	ministry of <b>HEALTH</b>

Sectors	Top Impacts	Current measures s 9(2)(f
	<ul> <li>Due to supply chain disruptions many foresters are operating below full capacity and workers have been stood-down or are working reduced hours. The East Coast of the North Island has been particularly hard hit, with one major log exporter – Pacific Forest Products (PFP) stopping operations. There have been some more positive signs in the last few days, with PFP announcing they expect to commence exporting next week. Harvesting may remain below full capacity, for example with crews operating a four day week.</li> <li>Clearance delays at ports have led to an increased shortage in cold store space in both China and New Zealand, resulting in meat products being shopped to lower value markets, and increasing pressure on-farm and to meat processing. It is estimated that it could take 2-4 weeks to clear the current backlog.</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>to investigate support already available (e.g. Work and Income, Inland Revenue, existing Rural Support Trust services and Federated Farmers' Member Employment Lawyer free service</li> <li>Guard Safety telephone support service for fishers under pressure from change</li> <li>In Gisborne, a primary industry group, focused on forestry, has been pulled together to identify those affected and provide advice on financials and how to get help and support for well-being.</li> <li>An 0800 number has been established for those concerned across primary industries.</li> <li>In most other regions Regional Advisory Groups are established to aid in well-being support alongside Rural Support Trust services.</li> </ul>



## Economy wide responses

s 9(2)(f)(iv)

Current measures
Initial reports of labour market impacts are concentrated in forestry, an industry that is both heavily exposed to China and facing a range of existing challenges (specifically low-cost competition from European spruce-beetle infested logs). Further labour market impacts will depend on firm perceptions of the length and extent of disruptions. If firms see disruptions as minor or short-lived, there are unlikely to be any significant impacts on employment. New Zealand currently has a tight labour market, with low unemployment and reported shortages of workers in a range of low-skill industries.
Inland Revenue is currently working at a local level with affected taxpayers in affected sectors.
Excessive provisional tax payments can be refunded. Under current settings, businesses that have paid provisional tax and are experiencing a substantial deterioration in sales can re-estimate their tax liability and receive a refund of excess tax paid.
The Ministry of Social Development's (MSD) financial assistance is available to individuals and families. This includes ongoing assistance such as Jobseeker Support for those who no longer have an income. Other ongoing assistance includes payments such as Accommodation Supplement and Working for Families tax credits that are available alongside main benefits. Further, hardship assistance such as Special Needs Grants and Temporary Additional Support are available to help with essential and immediate needs such as food and rent.
At this stage MSD considers its standard suite of assistance is appropriate but is continuing to monitor the situation.
Those who temporarily lose their job may be eligible for Emergency Benefit, which is generally paid at the same rate as Jobseeker Support. Emergency Benefit has discretion to not apply a benefit stand-down period. MSD also offers a wide range of employment services and support. People who have lost their job may be able to use this assistance to help them re-enter the workforce.
NZTE information webpage and an Advisory Panel for exporters to supplement the expertise and support available through NZTE's Greater China Team



Health Report: 20200201

